History of Christian Responses to Poverty

SYLLABUS

Episcopal Divinity School, January Term 2012

Course ID: CH 2100
January 9-20, 2012,
Schedule: Mon-Fri 10 AM – noon, Sherrill Hall (library building) room 153
Instructor: Dr. Susan Holman
(povertystudies@aol.com)

Course website with links to all reserve readings:

Background

Credit: This is a full 3-credit term course and thus students should expect a very intensive experience and be prepared for a full commitment to the course with no other responsibilities during those 2 weeks.

Summary:
This course will explore several key themes in historical Christian responses to poverty, ranging from charity to human rights. The overall focus of the course and all assignments will be an invited opportunity to engage in the relationships between historical responses of the past and contemporary 21st century faith-based organizations who are active in related issues today. Our focus in most of the selected themes will be on how poverty responses relate to issues of global health, health care dynamics, and social justice and human rights in resource-poor settings around the world. The course may be particularly relevant for graduate students in theological schools associated with the BTI who are preparing for ministry or social service/action. The conceptual background for the course is briefly summarized below. Required textbooks (listed below) will be supplemented extensively with both articles and chapters that will be available on reserve as well as required and recommended reading of material available online.

Conceptual Background:
The Christian religious narrative of (involuntary) poverty and faith-based relief and social justice activities continues to shape faith-based organizations (FBOs) in international relief today. This course will consider this narrative with a focus on two interrelated themes. The first is that of charity and its common association with social welfare and the conditionality of gift and gratitude. The second is that of human rights, commonly associated with social justice and equity. Religious responses to poverty have been shaped traditionally by moral and ethical appeals to help the “other” on the basis of one, both, or some mix of these ideas as they affect provision and distribution of goods and services such as food, water, housing, education, employment and health care. These distinctions in approach matter for the church because FBOs continue to serve as key players in global humanitarian aid and development initiatives where human need is most acute.

In this course we will look at select historical views as expressed in pre- and post-Reformation texts up to the present. Topics considered will include: religious (predominantly Christian) texts from Graeco-Roman late antiquity and the patristic period, relief rhetoric in the 15-17th centuries, the
rise of Elizabethan welfare concepts and their influence on the English-speaking world into the 20th century, charity/gift language as it finds voice in religious encounters, the role of particular reformers and reform movements in shaping human rights ideas and applications, (e.g. religious cautions and sensitivities in the creation of the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights), gift/justice dynamics in modern Catholic Social Thought and Liberation Theology, and the role of contemporary international documents on economic, social and cultural rights in FBO responses to global missions today, particularly those relating to health. We will deliberately consider each historical example in comparative context, in light of a particular conceptual approach and will compare it with a text from a different historical period that touches on a related issue. The readings and assignments will encourage reflection on the balance of gift, charity, and entitlement concepts, and how resulting tensions, challenges, and successes may inform contemporary response. Critical discussion will particularly explore the aspect of reciprocity and gratitude in gift exchange and how this is treated in popular concepts of Christian giving.

Course Objectives
1. To establish a critically informed awareness of gift/justice tensions in religious discussions of global poverty as it relates to economic, social and cultural rights
2. To promote dialogue about contexts where such issues affect how the Christian tradition engages in related ministries today
3. To equip students with the scholarly resources and tools they may need to build a synthesis that can promote community healing and solidarity in resource-poor settings
4. To encourage personal lifestyle evaluation as it relates to making integrated choices about possessions, charity, gifting, and social justice.

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS & EXPECTATIONS:

Structure:
Classroom meetings are organized into ten 2-hour sessions. Most sessions will consist of a one-hour illustrated lecture and a period of seminar-like classroom discussion. The final two days will consist of student project presentations.

Performance expectations:
Students are required to attend all sessions punctually, to participate in discussion, and to complete written assignments. Papers, classroom discussion, and final presentation must demonstrate original thinking about the course topic and understanding and completion of all required readings. During the discussion sessions of each class, students are expected to engage with one another’s ideas and reflections with mutual respect, and to promote collaborative relevant dialogue.

Grading will be based on in-class performance and successful timely completion of the following assignments:

1. Brief reflection paper: due on the first day of class (Session 1, January 9, 2012)
   Please write a 3-5 pages in response to the pre-assignment readings and bring it with you to the first class, for reference in the discussion session and to hand in. The purpose of this paper is to help you think through and express for your classmates your own perspective on the course issues and the challenge of relating past and present in Christian ministry and social justice. The paper will equip you for the first class discussion. Details will be emailed to registered students around Dec. 20.

2. Comparative book review (4-7 pp; please do not exceed 7 pages double spaced),
due Monday, January 16, 2012
Select and read two books from the list provided (see course website). One of the two must be a "historical" text (for convenience defined as 19th century or earlier) and the other must address modern issues relevant to faith-based poverty response in the 20th & 21st centuries. Please speak with me if you wish to review a book on the list that you cannot readily find in the library or if you wish to substitute a book not on the list for one of your two selections.
Your review must include the following points:
(a) a short summary of each book, identifying the author's religious or philosophical perspective, thesis, and conclusions/recommendations (2 pages),
(b) your original analysis comparing and contrasting historical and contemporary perspectives as you find them in the book.
Your comparison will depend on what books you select, but might consider the following questions, for example: How would the historical perspective intersect (or conflict) with the modern viewpoint? How would each of the two narratives help and/or challenge specific fieldwork in ministry or faith-based activities related to poverty response and social justice in your experience? How might you find the books relevant to ministry or community engagement familiar to your experience?

3. Oral presentation of final paper project proposal, with outline and working bibliography, due in class at a scheduled time at the end of the second week
The purpose of the oral presentation is an opportunity to discuss your project ideas with your classmates. Depending on the size of the class, you should plan a 7-10 minute verbal summary your ideas, followed by open discussion, questions, and suggestions from the group. The oral presentation is not intended to be a polished presentation of a final result but a working session to help your research and ideas. Please bring enough printed copies of your outline and bibliography for the rest of the class (or discuss with me in advance). See description of final project below for more information.

The purpose of the final paper is to synthesize historical material readings and issues discussed in class into a presentation that applies the course ideas to a specific setting, example, situation, controversy, mission-based dynamic or conflict. The paper should identifies and evaluate the issues that made the topic or event important to faith-based responses to poverty. The paper must integrate past and present in a manner that demonstrates a thoughtful and original understanding of the readings and discussions during the course.

Students must select their paper topic by the end of the first week of class. Your topic might be, for example, a specific idea or situation about a particular setting, project, case, ministry, policy, or other related "real-world" faith-based response to poverty, either in the present or in the past. Please feel free to select a topic that you think might be directly relevant to your work or career. The final paper should be a thoughtful, critical, and original exploration of the selected situation that integrates both past and present issues discussed throughout the class. Integrate past and present: If you choose a present-day situation, you will be graded on how you integrate historical (past) texts into your vision, critique, and/or analysis. If you choose an example from Christian history between the early church and the 19th century (inclusive), you will be graded on how you incorporate contemporary ideologies into your discussion. Your selected example must have its roots in Western religious thought but need not be a specifically Christian example. (For instance, you could choose a project funded by a "secular" aid organization as long as your focus and discussion was on the place of relevant faith-based activities.)
Please discuss your project ideas with me by no later than the end of the first week (Friday, Jan. 13). You will be presenting your idea (and draft bibliography) to the class in the second week, so be sure to give yourself time to plan a classroom discussion about your idea that will be useful to you.

Your final paper, due February 14, should include the following parts/sections:
1. Brief background history of the chosen example, why you chose it, and why you think it is important.
2. An analysis of what did/does or did/does not “work” in the intersection of religion and poverty relief, social justice as it related to poverty, or related issues (for instance, solidarity, human dignity, etc.) in your selected example
3. Your ideas, vision, and suggestions for change based on your research and drawing from course discussions/readings.
4. Conclusion
5. Appropriate footnotes or endnotes that give proper credit for the ideas and sources you include,

LENGTH: No more than 25 pages (including notes) double-spaced using a standard font, size 12

STYLE GUIDE: Use standard punctuation, spelling, and citation style. If in doubt, follow a standard such as the Chicago Manual of Style or the SBL Handbook of Style.

DUE: February 14, 2012. The student is fully responsible to for the paper—in a readable presentation format (Microsoft Word, PDF, or printed paper document) reaching the professor by the due date.

Course Assessment: Student performance will be evaluated as follows:

Brief reflection paper (due first day of class) 10%
Attendance 10%
Class participation 20%
Comparative book review (due start of class on Monday 1/16) 15%
Oral project/presentation (including outline & bibliography) 15%
Paper (due no later than February 14) 30%

Required books (available at the Harvard Coop):

3. Carter Lindberg, *Beyond Charity: Reformation Initiatives for the Poor* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993) [note this book is out of print but the Coop should have used copies available and a Kindle version is available for purchase on Amazon.com; The course texts will also be available on reserve]
4. John Witte & Frank S. Alexander, eds. *Christianity and Human Rights: An Introduction* (NY: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2010. [note: we will only read the chapters in this book—about half—that relate to economic rights; the remaining chapters, on civil and political rights, may be useful to you as a reference for the future]

The required books will be supplemented by extensive supplementary readings available in pdf/on reserve and/or at various websites online.
**SESSIONS AND READINGS**

- **v** = required readings
- **∇** = recommended/optional readings

**PREASSIGNMENT (Readings for Session 1) (note: there are 2 parts to this first assignment)**

Note: Because of the intense nature of the January term, the pre-assignment is intentionally designed to introduce complex interpretive issues that will shape our discussion throughout the course. The assignment may need several days of reflection. The more carefully you think through these readings in advance, the better they will equip you to enjoy the course!

1. **Reflection paper**

When we read texts about poverty and injustice, including those from historical sources, we inevitably carry into our reading our own awareness of memory. This awareness may aid our ability to relate to others empathetically, but it may also influence our “blind spots”, biases, and assumptions about what we read, and affect the way we understand and discuss the persons, cultures, and dynamics of the past. Please read the two chapters listed below and write no more than 5 pages in response to the following questions:

   a) How do the issues and interpretive concepts about memory, and “translation” or cross-cultural interpretation that are discussed in these two readings relate to your own approach to poverty, injustice, and religious responses in the present – and in the past? What aspect(s) of the readings do you most agree / disagree with, and why?
   b) How does your viewpoint and “remembering” related to human need and the balance of wealth and poverty affect your ideas about traditional Christian “charity”?
   c) Please list at least two practices, concepts, or ideas related to the Christian history of poverty that come to mind as you read these two chapters and that you would like to consider during the course. Summarize briefly why these issues may be relevant to your work or life goals.

Please bring your response paper to the first class and be prepared to draw from it in the discussion. You will hand in your response paper at the end of the first class, so please be sure it has your name on it!

**Readings for reflection paper:**

- Holman, *God Knows There’s Need*, chapters 1-3 (pp. 1-70)

2. **Readings for the first class**

(Important background but you do not need to consider these in your reflection paper:)

- Witte & Alexander, pp. 1-62 (foreword by Desmond Tutu, “To be human is to be free”, introduction, and ch 1, Novak: “Judaic Foundation of Rights”, pp. 47-62)
"Deep Leadership: Interior Dimensions of Large Scale Change," a panel discussion with: Dr. Paul Farmer, Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu, Joe Madiath, and Cecelia Flores-Oebanda, at the 2011 Skoll World Forum on Social Entrepreneurship, March 31, 2011. online link through Partners In Health website at: http://www.pih.org/news/entry/Deep-leadership [98 minutes]. The link also includes transcript of Dr. Farmer’s remarks and a commentary. This is an extraordinary discussion among high-level world leaders known for their influence in addressing global health and justice, and includes dialogue on the influences of religion in their work. We will not directly discuss the video in the course but you may find it useful to watch it sometime before the first class.

[Optional/recommended]: Witte & Alexander, chapter 2 (Human rights and Roman ius)

Monday, January 9, 2012
SESSION 1: INTRODUCTIONS AND CONCEPTS FOR THIS COURSE
The first session will introduce the course themes, allow students to introduce themselves and begin to consider ideas for their final project; the introductory lecture will set the stage for key ideas, define leading concepts, and provide an overview of resources for further study. The lecture will be followed by a discussion in which students may share their perspective based on their response paper.

Scholars debate whether “human rights” began with the Enlightenment or is as old as legal concepts of justice. The first lecture will look at key themes around the identity of the poor in historical texts, including gift, gratitude, social welfare and social justice language, social and cultural contexts, how these early ideas influenced the development of later thought on religious response to poverty, and the challenges of reading historical texts in the context of similar issues today.

The discussion will start from students’ response papers to the pre-course readings, and focus on how (and whether) certain shared ideas may (or may not) be comparable to our modern views and how post-Reformation faith traditions influence interpretation as they relate to contemporary concerns.

Readings: See “Pre-Assignment” above

Tuesday, January 10, 2012
SESSION 2: EARLY CHRISTIAN POVERTY RELIEF: CHARITY vs. ESC RIGHTS
Early Christian responses to poverty are generally identified with “charity” rather than ideas about human rights or concerns with economic, social and cultural issues. The picture is not that simple; texts suggest a range of motivating factors for social action in emerging Christian culture in late antiquity. The second lecture will begin with an overview of early Christian responses to poverty between the first and fourth centuries. We will consider key controversies in the scholarship (particularly related to Pauline texts), and focus the discussion session on views of charity/rights that influence comments by Basil of Caesarea and John Chrysostom. Students will be asked to reflect on how these narratives compare with two later readings, a 19th century text about urban charity and a modern guide for practitioners in global health.

Readings to prepare for Session 2:
Required: (please read the first 2 “background” readings closely and be at least familiar with the other 2 for reference; please read both the Basil and Chrysostom sermons, thinking of comparisons)

BACKGROUND:

- Berma Klein Goldewijk & Bas de Gaay Fortman, Where Needs Meet Rights: Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in a New Perspective (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1999), pp. 1-18, 55-72, 140-146 (chapters 1, 5, and 10); [reserve pdf available on course website]
- Schroeder, Introduction (pp. 15-39)
  [note: We will discuss the UDHR and ICESCR in more detail during Session 6 (1/16); but you may find it useful to read now to have in mind during this first week's focus on earlier historical texts]
- Partners In Health, “Addressing the social determinants of health through a program on social and economic rights (POSER),” Program Management Guide unit 11, available at: http://parthealth.3cdn.net/675a22a656554488ac_o9m6y1csww.pdf [and also on the course website].

FOCUS FOR DISCUSSION:

- Basil of Caesarea: “I shall tear down my barns” (Hom. 6) and “In time of famine and drought” (Hom. 8), in Schroeder, pp. 59-88.
- Choose one selection from a 19th century text describing the American “alms-house.” A variety of links will be available on the website. Skim the one of most interest to you to get a sense of format, tone, and voice, and read as much as you wish. Be prepared to share with the class a few notes on what you read and how it might inform our understanding of Basil’s “poorhouse” in the fourth century.

Recommended/Optional:

- Facebook website of “New City Initiative,” a grant-funded project created by C. Paul Schroeder in Portland based on his interpretation of Basil’s vision: http://www.facebook.com/NewCityInitiative

Wednesday, January 11, 2012
SESSION 3: GIFTS AND BEGGING: POVERTY RELIEF AND MONASTICS
Our guest for this class will be Dr. Daniel Caner, Associate Professor of History and Classics at the University of Connecticut, Storrs, and currently Visiting Research Scholar at the Institute for the Study of the Ancient World at New York University. He is currently working on the theme of Christian gifts and religious wealth in the fifth-seventh century East (Early Byzantium). This entire 2-hour session will be structured as a discussion seminar. Please be prepared to consider how
issues of gift, begging, and the religious conceptual roots of voluntary and involuntary poverty in Western tradition continue to influence social welfare activities today.

**Readings to prepare for Session 3:**

**Required:**

- Selections from early Byzantine passages on almsgiving materials and quantity (pdf on course website)

**Recommended/Optional:**


**Thursday, January 12, 2012**

**SESSION 4: RESHAPING CIVIC ORDER: THE 16TH CENTURY**

The Protestant Reformation was an era of profound social upheaval and change. The theological ideas of Martin Luther, Zwingli, Calvin, and others intersected with economic revolution and conflict. The breakdown of traditional charitable monastic institutions led both Protestants and Catholics to proposals to reshape how society used goods and services to care for those in need. In this session, we will consider these transitions, the specific proposal of Catholic humanist, Juan de Vives for the city of Bruges. You may wish to reflect on how these examples might compare and contrast with that of 20th century liberation theology, which will be the focus of tomorrow’s session (Session 5).

**Readings to prepare for Session 4:**

**Required:**

**BACKGROUND:**

- Lindberg, Carter. *Beyond Charity: Reformation Initiatives for the Poor*, chapter 2 (pp. 68-127) and pages 179-185, 200-206 [readings: 5.5, 5.6, 7.1, and 7.2].
- Holman, *God Knows There’s Need*, chapters 4 and 7

**FOCUS FOR DISCUSSION:**

- Juan-Luis Vivès, “Concerning the Relief of the Poor or Concerning Human Need: A Letter Addressed to the Senate of Bruges, January 6, 1526,” trans. Margaret Sherwood (1917) (Reserve PDF on course website); includes a summary of Book 1 and all of Book 2.
Friday, January 13, 2012

SESSION 5: SOLIDARITY AND ACCOMPANIMENT: THE LEGACY OF LIBERATION THEOLOGY

(Be sure you have discussed your paper topic with me by the end of today)

Throughout history, faith-based voices on human need have often called for direct personal encounter with the poor. These voices include patristic authors advising on health care and empathetic discernment of individual problems and needs, monastics who devote their lives to social aid, and the concept of “solidarity” characterized by liberation theology. In this session, we consider several models of such faith-based accompaniment and the challenges it presents in concept and practice.

Note: Please also be sure to discuss your oral presentation/final paper project with me by the end of today. You may wish to use your comparative book review assignment (due on Monday) to focus on issues specifically relevant to your anticipated final project.

Readings to prepare for Session 5:

Required:

BACKGROUND:

- Ethna Regan, “Liberation Theology and Human Rights,” in idem, Theology and the Boundary Discourse of Human Rights (Georgetown: Georgetown University Press, 2010), pp. 143-77 (Reserve PDF on course website)
- Witte & Alexander, pp. 113-134 (=chapter 5, J. Brian Hehir on Vatican 2)

FOCUS FOR DISCUSSION:

- The “Syriac Man of God” (reserve PDF on course website)

Recommended/Optional:

- Witte & Alexander, chapters 6-7 (on rights and liberties, and on Calvinism)


"Poverty of the Church" and "Justice" by the Latin American Bishops, Medellin, Colombia, September 6, 1968. online and available on the course website.

Heidi B. Neumark, Breathing Space: A Spiritual Journey in the South Bronx, podcast interviews with Dick Staub. Four short radio interviews, all accessible at:
  http://www.thekindlings.com/category/podcasts/dick-staub-interviews-journeys/page/21/
  A written transcript of all four is available on the course website and taken from:


Witte & Alexander, ch. 16 (Seiple: "Christianity, human rights, and a theology that touches the ground"), pp. 320-334

Benson, Nellie, Streets and Lanes of the City (1891); full text online at http://www.povertystudies.org/StreetsAndLanesIndex.htm.

Monday, January 16, 2012

SESSION 6: CONTROVERSIES IN SOCIAL JUSTICE AND DEVELOPMENT: PART ONE: HUMAN RIGHTS LANGUAGE AND THE "ASSETS-BASED" APPROACH

The focus on human rights in social justice during the 20th century has not been without controversy. Alasdair MacIntyre is infamous for his comment that a belief in human rights is like believing in witches and unicorns; and others have questioned the broad application of rights concepts beyond their explicit meanings within legal justice. The early association of economic, social, and cultural (ESC) rights with "leftist" ideas during the Cold War created false divisions such that many Americans think of national rights as civic and political while relegating ESC rights to "international" concerns. At the same time, faith-based organizations comprise a substantial bulk of the non-governmental organizations (NGOs) that provide goods and services in resource-poor communities around the world today, particularly in the provision of health care and education. The rise of large-scale global funding responses to the HIV/AIDS crisis, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa in the early 21st century, resulted in a new focus on deliberately including religious leaders and community groups in efforts to advance global health, and encouraged concepts about the potential for "human" and "religious" "assets" in social justice and development initiatives. Yet discussions of human and religious "assets" raise questions about utilitarianism as well as the relationship of religion to Martha Nussbaum and Amartya Sen’s influential "capability" theories (Severine Deneulin and Lisa Cahill are two Christian ethicists whose work directly considers this relationship). In sessions 7 and 8, we will explore examples of these intersecting ideas and controversies, and will compare and contrast them with debates about related concepts in the earlier history of Christian responses to injustice. The discussion will give students the opportunity

10  revised 1/14/12
to look at several specific examples of human rights applications, asset-based approaches to poverty, and the contested role of religion in contemporary development initiatives. Although it is impossible to do justice to these ideas in two class sessions, these themes are highly relevant to ministry and faith-based social action; the goal of both classes is to provide a basic introduction to the terms and resources pertinent to global health that may have relevance for student field work and ministry experiences.

The readings are quite numerous; please read as much as you can of the “Required” list and note the “Recommended/Optional” resources that may be most useful to you in your work at a later time.

**Readings to prepare for Session 6:**

**Required:**

**BACKGROUND:**

- Please review the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (see session 2 above for online links)

**FOCUS FOR DISCUSSION:**

- "The vine and the elm," in *The Shepherd of Hermas* [available on course website]
- "Give me your tired, your poor, and their assets," Chapter 5 in Steve Corbett and Brian Fikkert, *When Helping Hurts: How to Alleviate Poverty without Hurting the Poor...And Yourself* (Chicago: Moody Publications, 2009), pp. 125-140 [reserve pdf on course website] [this is a very reader-friendly version of the asset-based development approach as it relates to religion]

**Recommended/Optional:**

- World Health Organization, Social Determinants of Health (SDH), website: http://www.who.int/social_determinants/en/  NOTE: You should become familiar with this website and the resources it describes, including the work of the Commission on Social Determinants of Health, and the papers that came out of the recent World Conference in Rio de Janeiro

Esther D. Reed, *The Ethics of Human Rights*, pp. 1-20 (Introduction)


**Tuesday, January 17, 2012**  *(Remember your comparative book review is due today)*

**SESSION 7: CONTROVERSIES IN SOCIAL JUSTICE AND DEVELOPMENT: PART TWO: RELIGION IN DEVELOPMENT**

**Readings to prepare for Session 7:**

**Required Readings:**


**Recommended/Optional Readings:**

For this session, you may find it useful to review the following readings from previous sessions:

- Partners In Health, *Program Management Guide* unit 11 (from Session 2)
- Nicholas Wolterstorff, “How My Mind has Changed” (selections) (from Session 4)

Of note, may be relevant in this area (not necessarily related to this session):


**Wednesday, January 18, 2012**

**SESSION 8: IMAGE AND LITURGY: THE INVOLUNTARY POOR IN ORTHODOXY CHRISTIAN ART AND HISTORY**

The Christian tradition represented by what is commonly called the “Orthodox Church” in modern culture is sometimes overlooked in discussion of faith-based social justice. Known best for its focus on the human person in the image of God (particularly in its rich tradition of icons), Orthodoxy Christianity contains notable examples of concern for philanthropy and the needy poor in both art and liturgical and monastic history. In this session, we consider the verbal use of visual language in several texts, recent modern examples of “Eastern Orthodox” focus on social justice, and other depictions of the poor in theological art.

**Required Readings**

**BACKGROUND**

- Witte & Alexander, pp. 32-43 (Witte) and 173-190 (McGuckin), both on Orthodoxy and human rights.
DISCUSSION

- Gregory of Nyssa, two sermons “On the love of the poor” (focus on second sermon)
- Holman, “Embodying Sacred Kingdom,” chapter 8 in *God Knows There’s Need*

**Recommended/Optional Readings:**

- “Images of the poor,” in Lee Palmer Wandel, *Always Among Us: Images of the Poor in Zwingli’s Zurich* (pp. 77-123). (reserve pdf on course website)

(Remember to bring to your presentation a rough outline of your paper and initial draft bibliography)

**SESSION 9: ORAL PRESENTATIONS**

**SESSION 10: ORAL PRESENTATIONS AND COURSE CONCLUSION**

REMINDER: Your final papers are due no later than February 14, 2012.